PL091167

ISSUE DATE:

August 2, 2013



Ontario Municipal Board Commission des affaires municipales de l'Ontario

IN THE MATTER OF subsection 17(40) of the *Planning Act*, R.S.O. 1990, c. P.13, as amended

Appellant: County of Simcoe

Appellant: Midhurst Development Doran Road Inc.,

and Carson Road Development Inc.

Appellant: Midhurst Rose Alliance Inc.
Appellant: Township of Springwater

Subject: Failure of the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and

Housing to announce a decision respecting the

Official Plan for the County of Simcoe

Municipality: County of Simcoe

OMB Case No.: PL091167 OMB File No.: PL091167

APPEARANCES:

See Attachment 1

DECISION DELIVERED BY SYLVIA SUTHERLAND AND M. A. SILLS AND ORDER OF THE BOARD

- [1] The List of Appellant Parties, followed by the List of Parties at this pre-hearing conference ("PHC") is found as Attachment 1 appended to this order.
- [2] The Participant's List was finalized at this PHC and is appended to this order as Attachment 2.
- [3] This is a decision on a motion by the County of Simcoe ("County") to dismiss the appeal of proposed Official Plan Amendment 43-OP-2008 ("Plan") by the Midhurst Ratepayers' Association ("MRA") dated August 21, 2012 ("Appeal") in its entirety heard on June 20, 2013 as part of a PHC on the Plan.
- [4] Supporting the motion were 451082 Ontario Limited, the Township of Springwater, Carson Road Development Inc. and Midhurst Development Doran Road

- 2 - PL091167

Inc., Midhurst Rose Alliance Inc., Midhurst Rose Alliance Johns Inc., Midhurst Rose Alliance Cooney Inc., Midhurst Rose Alliance O'Brien Inc. and the Estate of Marie Louise Frankcom.

- [5] The only Party opposing the motion was the MRA.
- [6] Generally, those supporting the motion did so on the following grounds:
 - This is not the appropriate forum in which to seek relief relating to the boundary of the Midhurst Settlement Area, and therefore the Appeal is an abuse of process.
 - The Appeal form filed by the MRA discloses no land use planning grounds. No specific information about what is being appealed, as required by s. 6(1) of the Board's appeal form, is given. The MRA Appeal states only "Proposed County of Simcoe Official Plan."
 - Section 6(2) of the form asked the appellant to outline the nature of the appeal and the reasons for it. It states "be specific and provide land-use planning reasons...." The Appeal states only "Lack of Decision." No land use planning grounds are given.
 - The MRA's appeal is posited on the singular issue of whether the Midhurst Settlement Area Boundary in the Plan and the land use designation within the boundary are appropriate. There are no land use designations within the Midhurst Settlement Area in Schedule 5.1 to the Plan beyond simply being identified as "settlement." The only issue, therefore, relates to the settlement area boundary.
 - Midhurst has been established as a settlement area since 1983, and its existing boundaries have been designated and delineated since 1998 by the approved Township of Springwater Official Plan ("SOP") and are recognized by the in-effect County Official Plan ("COP"), which was approved by the Province in 1998 and by the Board, upon appeal, in 1999.
 - The Midhurst Settlement Area Boundary identified in the Plan is the same boundary that has existed for the last 15 years.
 - The built boundary is clearly intended to be part of the settlement area.

PL091167

• The MRA acknowledges in its Notice of Response that it is pursuing an appeal of the Plan because it attempted to appeal the Midhurst Secondary Plan ("MSP"), OPA 38, almost one-and-a-half years after the expiry period, and was refused by the Board for being filed out of time. The MRA's real appeal is against the MSP, which, at no time during the three years from its date of adoption until the expiry of the appeal period did the MRA or any of its members appeal to the Board.

- 3 -

- The merits of the MSP are not before this panel of the Board.
- Significant public and private resources have been expended in reliance on the in-force settlement area boundaries. The Appeal is frivolous and vexatious, particularly since the MRA failed to exercise its statutory rights with respect to either the MSP or the related Class Environmental Assessment when it had an opportunity to do so.
- [7] In response, Ian Bender, the consulting planner for the MRA and the former director of planning for the County, maintains in his affidavit that no settlement area boundary is set out in the SOP, only a study area within which there will be future growth opportunities. He quotes the SOP as stating "previous development has generally expanded the settlement area to its limits as defined by the adjacent highway and surrounding agricultural and environmental lands."
- [8] Mr. Bender states that the SOP does not show settlement area boundaries on its schedules and opines that an appropriate settlement boundary of Midhurst encompasses the area where existing development is concentrated. He does not believe that the settlement area of Midhurst was established in the 1998 SOP and maintains that it should be established "in the context of the current policy regime led by the Growth Plan."
- [9] It is also Mr. Bender's position that the study area boundaries established by the SOP are an inappropriate device to manage growth throughout the Township, as the boundaries would accommodate growth that far exceeds the 20-year forecasts and allocations of the Growth Plan.
- [10] David Strachan, secretary-treasurer of the MRA, states in his affidavit (Exhibit 41) that "it must be made clear from the high level of MRA activity since becoming aware of the extent of the proposed development, that MRA would probably have appealed Simcoe's decision (re the MSP, OPA 38) had they known of it."

- 4 - PL091167

- [11] The Board, frankly, is at a loss as to why the MRA maintains it did not know of the County's decision on the MSP. In its response motion (Exhibit 36), Carson Road Development Inc. et al, states that the MRA "cannot plead ignorance with respect to the approval of the MSP, or the process for appealing the County's decision to appeal the same. The Appellant's (MRA's) website acknowledges that they have been aware of the MSP since at least 2008."
- [12] The response also points out that notice of the County's decision to approve the MSP, detailing the rights of appeal, was provided in accordance with the requirements of the *Planning Act* ("Act"). The County's decision to approve the MSP and the appeal period was also publicized in the local media. Six parties appealed within the required time frame.
- [13] When questioned by the Board as to why the MRA did not appeal the MSP within the required time frame, Margaret Hutchinson, spokesperson for the MRA, stated that "at least four members did not receive notice." The MRA has more than four members, and Exhibit 35 shows that the three, Connie Spek, Peter Young and Bette Bull, who swore affidavits that they did not receive notification of approval of OPA 38 by the County as required under the Act, were included on the list of those to whom Notice of Decision was mailed.
- [14] As to the status of the Midhurst settlement area, the Board accepts the position of Kathy Suggitt, manager of policy planning for the County, that it is indeed a settlement area, not a "study area" (Exhibit 35). Section 8.1 of the SOP includes policies that state that the Township's growth would be directed to these Urban Settlement Areas, and Midhurst is identified as one of two that would receive a significant amount of future growth. It is her opinion that map Schedule A-8 represents the entire Midhurst Settlement Area, and the reference to a "study area" is simply the area within which the secondary plan(s) would take place to ensure comprehensiveness and planning for long-term growth. Quite frankly, no other interpretation makes sense.
- [15] It is clear to the Board that the MRA's target is the MSP. It is also clear, that the MRA, having missed the opportunity for whatever reason, to appeal the MSP within the statutory time period is now attempting to come in through the back-door. The MSP (OPA 38) is not before the Board. It is now in force. The Settlement Boundary has been established, and the County, as well as many others, have relied on this 1998 boundary in the planning of infrastructure and subsequent land use. To undo what has been arrived at in an open and democratic process would be unfair to all those who

- 5 - PL091167

have relied upon it. The MRA, whose desire to retain the environment as its members now experience it, the Board well understands have missed its opportunity to do so.

- [16] As Mr. Strachan so aptly put it in his affidavit, the "MRA has uncovered many more issues with OPA 38 than with the County Plan, but accepts that this may not be the appropriate forum in which to present evidence." In that he is correct.
- [17] Rule 56 of the Board's Rules of Practice and Procedure allows the Board to dismiss a proceeding without holding a hearing if, among others, the reasons set out in the notice of appeal do not disclose any apparent land use planning ground upon which all or part of the appeal could be allowed. Section 17(45) of the *Planning Act* ("Act") states that the Board may dismiss all or part of an appeal without holding a hearing on its own initiative or on the motion of any party if it is of the opinion that,:
 - (i) the reasons set out in the notice of appeal do not disclose any apparent land use planning ground upon which the plan or part of the plan that is the subject of the appeal could be approved or refused by the Board.
- [18] The Board grants the motion and dismisses the appeal of Proposed Official Plan Amendment 43-OP02008 by the Midhurst Ratepayers' Association dated August 21, 2012, in its entirety.

"Sylvia Sutherland"

SYLVIA SUTHERLAND MEMBER

"M. A. Sills"

M. A. SILLS MEMBER

ATTACHMENT 1

Simcoe County Official Plan Prehearing Conference #3 List of Attendees June 20, 2013

Counsel/Representative	Appellant/Party/Participant
Roger Beaman/David Germain	Appellant 1
Jeff Davies	Appellants 2a, 2b
Cory Estrela/A. D'Andrea (student-at-law)	Appellants 8a, 8c, 8d, 8e, 8f, 8g, 11, 12a,
Cory Estretair. B rinarea (student at law)	12b, 13, 14, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26
Brent Spagnol*/Robert Brindley*	Appellant 6
Edward Veldboom	Parties C1, C2
Quinto Annibale/Mark Joblin	Party D
Leo Longo	Appellant 30, Party B
Leo Longo (for Tom Halinski)	Party E
Wes Crown*	Party F
Ian Rowe/Adrianna Pilkington	Appellant 17, Parties G1, G2, G3, V, X
James Feehely	Appellant 7, Party H
Stephen Waqué	Party I
Ken Hare/Soojin Lee	Party A
Tanya Nayler	Appellants 3, 4
Ira Kagan/Paul DeMelo	Appellant 5
Jennifer Meader	Appellant 10
Jennifer Drake	Appellant 15
David Strachan*/Margaret Hutchison*	Appellant 16
Patricia Foran	Appellant 18
Chris Barnett	Appellants 27a, 27b
Caterina Facciolo	Appellants 28, 29, Party M
Brian Goodreid*	Appellants 19a, 19b
Mary Bull/Alexandra Sadvari	Parties J1, J2, J3, J4, J5, J6, K
Michael Vaughan	Party L
John Dawson	Party P
John Barzo	Party Q
Susan Rogers	Party R
Harold Elston	Parties S, T
Sandy Agnew*	Participant 1
Ann Romano*	Participant 3
Raivo Uukkivi	Participant 5
Paolo Sacilotto*	Participant 6
Bernard Pope*	Participant 8
Anne Ritchie-Nahuis*	Participant 9
Wendy Harry*	Participant 10
Chantale Gagnon*	Participant 11
Marvin Geist	Participant 13
John Strong*	Participant 16
-	-

^{*}Agent

-7- PL091167

LIST OF APPELLANT PARTIES-COUNTY OF SIMCOE OFFICIAL PLAN PL091167

No.	Appellant	Lawyer/Agent	E-mail Address
1	County of Simcoe	Roger Beaman	rbeaman@thomsonrogers.com
	2a Carson Road Development	Susan Rosenthal	susanr@davieshowe.com
	Inc.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
2	2b Midhurst Development Doran	Buvia vvinic	david.wiite c devi yiuw.eu
	Road Inc.		
3	Craighurst Land Corp.	Susan Rosenthal	susanr@davieshowe.com
4	Huntingwood Trails	Susan Rosenthal	susanr@davieshowe.com
4	(Collingwood) Ltd.	Tanya Nayler	tanyan@davieshowe.com
5	Midhurst Rose Alliance Inc.	Ira Kagan	ikagan@ksllp.ca
<u> </u>		Paul DeMelo	pdemelo@ksllp.ca
6	Township of Springwater	Barnet Kussner	bkussner@weirfoulds.ca
7	451082 Ontario Limited	James Feehely	jfeehely@feehelygastaldi.com
	8a 861945 Ontario Ltd.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
	8b Golfview Estates Limited W/D	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
	8c Mark Rich Homes Limited		
8	8d Silver Spring View Estates		
Ū	Limited		
	8e Simcoe Estates Limited		
	8f Royal Heights Estates Limited		
	8g OMC Development Corp.	x 1 75 1	101
9	Innisfil Alcona Limited	Lynda Townsend	lyn.townsend@ltownsend.ca
	[Withdrawn]	Jennifer Meader	jennifer.meader@ltownsend.ca
10	Tesmar Holdings Inc.	Lynda Townsend Jennifer Meader	lyn.townsend@ltownsend.ca
	Janice & David Wright	David White	jennifer.meader@ltownsend.ca david.white@devrylaw.ca
11	Janice & David Wright	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
	12a Snow Valley Planning	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
12	Corporation	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
12	12b 453211 Ontario Limited	Cory Estroia	eory.estroia e de vrytaw.ea
	McMahan Woods Developments	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
13	Ltd.	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
1.4	Innisfil Beach Farms Inc.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
14		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
1.5	Estate of Marie Louise Frankcom	David Bronskill	dbronskill@goodmans.ca
15		Jennifer Drake	jdrake@goodmans.ca
16	Midhurst Ratepayers'	David Strachan*	davidistrachan@yahoo.com
10	Association [incorporated body]	Margaret Hutchison*	mhutchis1000@gmail.com
17	Narinder Mann	Ian Rowe	irowe@barristonlaw.com
1/	TVALITICEL IVIAIIII	Adrianna Pilkington	apilkington@barristonlaw.com
18	Yorkwood Group of Companies	Patricia Foran	pforan@airdberlis.com
	19a Rama Resorts International Inc.	Brian Goodreid*	briangoodreid@hotmail.com
19	19b Fernbrook Homes (Rama)		
	Limited		

20	1091402 Ontario Ltd.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
20	[Withdrawn]	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
21	Nicole and Brent Fellman	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
21		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
22	Travel-Rite Property Corp.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
22		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
23	Aqua-Gem Investments Ltd.	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
23		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
24	442023 Ontario Limited	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
24		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
25	1045901 Ontario Limited	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
23		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
26	Kellwatt Limited	David White	david.white@devrylaw.ca
20		Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@devrylaw.ca
27	27a Ontario Potato Distributing Inc.	Chris Barnett	cbarnett@davis.ca
	27b 1567219 Ontario Limited		
28	Black Marlin Management Inc.	Caterina Facciolo	cfacciolo@bratty.com
		Barry Horosko	bhorosko@bratty.com
29	Ahmadiyya Muslim Jama'at	Caterina Facciolo	cfacciolo@bratty.com
	Canada Inc. (AMJC)	Barry Horosko	bhorosko@bratty.com
30	D.G. Pratt Construction Limited	Jane Pepino	jpepino@airdberlis.com
30		Andrea Skinner	askinner@airdberlis.com
31	Hanson Development Group	Patricia Foran	pforan@airdberlis.com

^{*}Agent

- 9 - PL091167

LIST OF PARTIES-COUNTY OF SIMCOE OFFICIAL PLAN PL091167

) T	LIST OF PARTIES- COUNTY		
No.	Party	Representative/Agent	E-mail Address
	National Control of the Control of t	VII	land have Garage
A	Ministry of Municipal Affairs and	Ken Hare	ken.hare@ontario.ca
D	Housing Town of Collingwood	Soojin Lee	soojin.lee@ontario.ca
В	Town of Collingwood	Leo Longo Edward Veldboom	llongo@airdberlis.com
C	C1 Town of Penetanguishene C2 Township of Ramara	Edward Veldboom	eveldboom@russellchristie.com
D	Town of Innisfil	Quinto Annibale	qannibale@loonix.com
В	Town of Bradford	Tom Halinski	thalinski@airdberlis.com
\mathbf{E}	West Gwillimbury	10111 Hailliski	<u>unamiski@andocms.com</u>
F	Town of Midland	Paul Peterson	ppeterson@hgrgp.ca
	G1 Township of Clearview	Ian Rowe	irowe@barristonlaw.com
G	G2 Township of Tiny	Adrianna Pilkington	apilkington@barristonlaw.com
	G3 Town of Wasaga Beach		
Н	Town of New Tecumseth	James Feehely	jfeehely@feehelygastaldi.com
I	Township of Adjala-Tosorontio	Christel Higgs	chiggs@blg.com
1		Stephen Waqué	swaque@blg.com
	J1 Ontario Stone, Sand and Gravel	Mary Bull	mbull@woodbull.ca
	Association	Alexandra Sadvari	asadvari@woodbull.ca
	J2 CBM Aggregates, a division of		
J	St. Marys Cement (Canada) Inc.		
J	J3 Lafarge Canada Inc.		
	J4 Holcim (Canada) Inc.		
	J5 James Dick Construction Limited		
	J6 Walker Aggregates Inc.)	1 110 11 11
K	Georgian International Land Corp.	Mary Bull	mbull@woodbull.ca
T	San Marco in Lamis Ltd.	Alexandra Sadvari	asadvari@woodbull.ca michaelbvaughan@yahoo.ca
L		Michael Vaughan	
M	White Water Holdings Ltd.	Barry Horosko Caterina Facciolo	bhorosko@bratty.com cfacciolo@bratty.com
N	N [Now Appellant 28]		Clacelolo Colatty.com
	No Jet Construction Inc.	Caterina Facciolo	efacciolo@bratty.com
0	Remington Homes (Manhattan) Inc.	Barry Horosko	bhorosko@bratty.com
	[Withdrawn] Sleeping Lion Development	John Dawson	idawson@mccarthy.co
P	Corporation	John Dawson	jdawson@mccarthy.ca
Q	John Barzo Limited	John Barzo	jbarzo@barzolaw.com
	Innisfil Mapleview Developments	Susan Rogers	susan.rogers@sdrogerslaw.ca
R	Limited		
S	2133952 Ontario Inc.	Harold Elston	harold@elstons.ca
T	Talisker Corporation	Harold Elston	harold@elstons.ca
U	U1 and U2 [Now Appellant 27]		
V	1651012 Ontario Ltd. now	Ian Rowe	irowe@barristonlaw.com
	Sandycove Acres Limited	Adrianna Pilkington	apilkington@barristonlaw.com
\mathbf{w}	Township of Oro-Medonte	Chris Williams	cwilliams@airdberlis.com
**	000001.0	Andria Leigh	aleigh@oro-medonte.ca
X	998991 Ontario Inc.	Ian Rowe	irowe@barristonlaw.com
		Adrianna Pilkington	apilkington@barristonlaw.com

- 10 - PL091167

<u>ATTACHMENT 2</u> LIST OF PARTICIPANTS -- COUNTY OF SIMCOE OFFICIAL PLAN PL091167

No.	Interest/Participant	Representative/Agent	SIMCOE OFFICIAL PLAN PL091167 E-mail Address
INU.	microsy'r arucipalli	Representative/Agent	L-man Address
	AWARE Simcoe	Sandy Agnew	sagnew@ecomedic.ca
	71W/MCL Sinicoc	William French	bill.french@hotmail.com
		Alec Adams	alec.adams@rogers.com
		David Collacut	dave@collacutt.ca
1		Tom Kurtz	tom.kurtz@sympatico.ca
		Debbie Major	debbie@datadirect.ca
		Ann Truyens	at@iglide.net
		Constance Spek	spek.family@gmail.com
	PURE	Chantale Gagnon	chantalegagnon@bell.net
2	1012	Linda Gaspar	chickenqueen17@yahoo.ca
_		David Perryman	dperryman43@sympatico.ca
3	(Midhurst)	Ann Romano	am_romano@hotmail.com
4	Twp Oro Medonte	[Now Party W]	
	Tsam Investments Ltd.	Raivo Uukkivi	ruukkivi@casselsbrock.com
5		Signe Leisk	sleisk@casselsbrock.com
	Walton Development and	Jason Child	jchild@walton.com
6	Management L.P.	Paolo Sacilotto	psacilotto@walton.com
7	(Midhurst)	Paul Frankcom	Withdrawn
	Ontario Farmland	Bernard Pope	bernard@ontariofarmlandpreservation.org
8	Preservation		-
_	Simcoe County Federation of	Colin Elliott	rockeynol32@gmail.com
9	Agriculture	Anne Ritchie-Nahius	nahuis@csolve.net
10	Angus Ratepayers	Wendy Harry	TCB4E@primus.ca
10	Association	Archie Duckworth	marg_archie@hotmail.com
	11a Nutristock Corporation	Jennifer Meader	jennifer.meader@ltownsend.ca
11	11b Solmar (Healy)		
12	Corporation (App 27a, 27b)	Henry Sander	heandar@townshinafsayarn aam
	Township of Severn K. Winter Sanitation Inc.	Marvin Geist	hsander@townshipofsevern.com
13	K. Winter Santation inc. Kenneth and Ruth Winter	wiarvin Geist	marvin@marvingeist.ca
14	(ANSI – Oro-Medonte)	Joe & Ruth-Ann Langman	ruthannlangman@gmail.com
15	(ANSI – Severn)	Don & June Bickell	paniswickweld@aol.com
	John Strong	John Strong	No e-mail given; 705-424-9350
16			6760 Simcoe County Road 21
			Essa Township, Ontario, L9R 1V2
17	Clearview Community	Janet Gillham	gillham2@bell.net
17	Association		
18	(App 27a, 27b)	Ralph MacKenzie	905-729-3984
19	, , ,	Kevin Newman	k.newman@rogers.com
20		Jill Appleby	
21	(Midhurst)	Sandy Buxton	s.buxton@rogers.com
	R & M Homes Limited	Cory Estrela	cory.estrela@Devrylaw.ca
22	(Everett)		
22	285622 Ontario Ltd.	Emil Mlinarevic	emilm@millersonconsulting.com
23	(MIDVES II)		
	·	Bette Bull	